



Report of the Scoping Inquiry into Historical Sexual Abuse in Day and Boarding Schools Run by Religious Orders

Mary O'Toole, SC
June 2024

Chapter Outline



Report of the Scoping Inquiry into Historical Sexual Abuse in Day and Boarding Schools Run by Religious Orders

Mary O'Toole, SC
June 2024



Acknowledgements

The Scoping Inquiry would like to acknowledge the assistance of the many people and organisations who have assisted with our work. Most importantly, we would like to thank all those who participated in the Survivor Engagement process. It would not have been possible to complete the work of the Scoping Inquiry without them and other survivors, and for that we are sincerely grateful. We would like, in particular, to acknowledge the important contribution of the late Mark Ryan, and his brother David, to the establishment of the Scoping Inquiry.

The Scoping Inquiry would also like to thank the following:

- Quality Matters, in particular Caroline Gardner and Oileán Carter Strich, for their assistance in the Survivor Engagement process.
- Dr Helen Buckley, author of the independent report on child protection.
- The Centre for Effective Services, in particular Andrew Bray and Dr Máire Brophy, authors of the independent report on restorative justice.
- The religious orders and their staff, who provided information to the Scoping Inquiry in response to requests.
- The Association of Missionaries and Religious in Ireland ('AMRI'), in particular David Rose and Gerard Gallagher.
- The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland ('NBSCCCI'), in particular, Teresa Devlin.
- The Association of Community and Comprehensive Schools ('ACCS'), in particular John Irwin and Áine O'Sullivan.
- The Association of Patrons and Trustees of Catholic Schools ('APTCS'), in particular Dr Eilis Humphreys.
- Education and Training Boards Ireland.
- The Child and Family Agency, Tusla, in particular Mike Corcoran and Cora Kelly.
- The Data Protection Commission, in particular David J. Murphy, Georgeta Botas and Lauren Burke.
- The Central Statistics Office, in particular Helen McGrath.
- The National Archives, in particular Orlaith McBride, Helen Hewson and Niamh McDonnell.
- An Garda Síochána, in particular Detective Chief Superintendent Colm Noonan and the Garda National Protective Services Bureau.
- The Methodist Association of Ireland, in particular Rev. Dr. Heather Morris.

- Ian Elliott, safeguarding consultant.
- Professor Eoin O’Sullivan, Professor of Social Work and Social Policy, Trinity College Dublin.
- Her Honour Judge Yvonne Murphy and Ita Mangan BL.
- His Excellency, Archbishop Luis Mariano Montemayor, the Papal Nuncio
- Officials at the Department of Health, the Department of Justice, the Department of Children, Equality, Disability, Integration and Youth, the Department of Defence, and the Department of Foreign Affairs, and the Health Service Executive.

The Scoping Inquiry would like to thank Aoife Conduit, Martina Mannion and Brian Power at the Department of Education. In addition, One in Four provided considerable assistance, particularly at the outset of the work of the Scoping Inquiry, and the Scoping Inquiry wishes to thank the team, in particular Deirdre Kenny and the organisation’s now-retired CEO, Maeve Lewis.

The Scoping Inquiry would like to thank a number of people who provided insight into the impact of inquiries on survivors, and matters relating to restorative justice, including: Professor Anne-Marie McAlinden, Dr Marie Keenan, Dr James Gallen, Dr Sophie Van der Valk, Dr Sinéad Ring and Dr Ian Marder.

The Scoping Inquiry would also like to thank our team of researchers: Rachael O’Byrne BL, Davy Lalor BL, Dr James Rooney BL, James Kneale BL, Dr Róisín Costello BL, and Dr Cliona Barnes.

Special mention must go to our administration team, whose exemplary work was essential to the functioning of the Scoping Inquiry: Janice Gaffney, Dorothy McCormack and Megan Dollery.

Scoping Inquiry Team:

- Mary O’Toole SC, Chair
- Kieran McGrath, Survivor Engagement Lead
- Michele Clarke, Survivor Engagement Advisor
- Julie Maher BL, Counsel to the Inquiry
- Finn Keyes BL, Research Lead to the Inquiry

Glossary

ACCS	Association of Comprehensive and Community Schools
AEARS	Alternative Education Assessment and Registration Service
AGS	An Garda Síochána
AIRR	Access to Institutional and Related Records Project
AJP	Association of Joint Patrons of Community and Comprehensive Schools
AMRI	The Association of Leaders of Missionaries and Religious of Ireland
APTCS	The Association of Patrons and Trustees of Catholic Schools
CAMHS	Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services
CAPP	Child Abuse Prevention Programme
CASP	Child Abuse Substantiation Procedure
CCJ	Criminal Courts of Justice
CEP	Common Experience Payment (Canada)
CEP	Catholic Education Partnership
CES	Centre for Effective Services
CFA	Child and Family Agency (Tusla)
CFIDIG	Children First Inter-Departmental Implementation Group
CICA	Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse
CORU	Ireland's multi professional health regulator
CORI	Conference of Religious of Ireland
COSICA	Commissioner for Survivors of Institutional Child Abuse
CPD	Continuing Professional Development
CSA	Child Sexual Abuse
CSO	Central Statistics Office
CSSCU	Child Safeguarding Statement Compliance Unit
DCC	Designated Community Colleges
DCEDIY	Department of Children, Equality, Disability, Integration & Youth
DLP	Designated Liaison Person
DPC	Data Protection Commission
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
DPSU	Divisional Protective Services Unit (a specialist unit of An Garda Síochána)
EAG	Expert Assurance Group

ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ERST	The Edmund Rice Schools Trust
ETB	Education and Training Board
ETBI	Education and Training Boards Ireland
GDPR	General Data Protection Regulation
HIAI	Historical Institutional Abuse Inquiry (Northern Ireland)
HIQA	Health Information and Quality Authority
HSE	Health Service Executive
IAP	Independent Assessment Process
IARG	Inter Agency Review Group
IASW	Irish Association of Social Workers
IICSA	Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse (England & Wales)
INTO	Irish National Teachers' Organisation
IRSSA	Indian Residential Schools Settlement Agreement (Canada)
IRSCC	Indian Residential School Survivor Committee (Canada)
LSR	Local Safeguarding Representative
NBSCCCI	National Board for the Safeguarding of Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland
NCCA	National Council for Curriculum Assessment
NCCIS	National Child Care Information System
NCRR	National Centre for Research and Remembrance
NCTR	National Centre for Truth and Reconciliation (Canada)
NDA	Non-Disclosure Agreement
NEWB	National Educational Welfare Board
NSHCC	Nova Scotia home for Colored Children (Canada)
OCD	Obsessive Compulsive Disorder
PJP	Public Juridic Person
PDST	Professional Development Service of Teachers
PTSD	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
QM	Quality Matters
RIRB	Residential Institutions Redress Board
RSE	Relationship and Sexuality Education
SCAI	Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry

SJORI St. Joseph's Orphanage Restorative Inquiry (USA)
SPHE Social, Personal & Health Education
SVS Sexual Violence Survey
TRC Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada
Tusla The Child and Family Agency
VEC Vocational Education Committees
V-SAC Victim Support at Court
VSCP Victim-Survivors Consultative Panel (England and Wales)
VSJO Voices of St. Joseph's Orphanage (USA)
VSS Victims and Survivors Service (Northern Ireland)
WSO Witness Support Officers (Northern Ireland)

Table of Contents

VOLUME 1	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
INTRODUCTORY MATTERS	
1. Introduction	21
WHAT SURVIVORS HAVE TOLD US	
2. Introduction to the Survivor Engagement Process and Methodology	29
3. First Stage of the Survivor Engagement Process and Other Contributions	48
4. Second Stage of the Survivor Engagement Process: Participants' Accounts of What Happened	61
5. Participant Accounts of the Impact of Sexual Abuse on their Childhood and Adolescence	113
6. Participant Accounts of the Impact of Childhood Sexual Abuse in Adulthood	134
7. What Participants Want to See Next	175
8. Summary of the Survivor Engagement Process	222
VOLUME 2	225
THE EXTENT OF ALLEGATIONS OF SEXUAL ABUSE IN IRISH SCHOOLS	
9. Identifying the Extent of Allegations of Historical Sexual Abuse: Religious Order Records	226
10. Other Sources of Data on Numbers of Allegations	264
11. The Extent of Records Held by Public Bodies and Other Organisations	281
THE CONTEXT OF SEXUAL ABUSE IN IRISH SCHOOLS	
12. The Irish Education System	298
13. The Position of Special Schools	341

VOLUME 3	355
LESSONS FROM PAST INQUIRIES INTO CHILD ABUSE	
14. Functions, Powers and Procedures of Tribunals of Inquiry and Commissions of Investigation	356
15. Methodology and Procedures of Previous Inquiries	376
16. The Impact of the Scope of Inquiries on Survivors	412
17. International Inquiries into Child Sexual Abuse	431
18. Research on Survivors' Experiences of Inquiries	467
VOLUME 4	487
THE CURRENT CHILD PROTECTION FRAMEWORK	
19. Critical Analysis of Previous Inquiries' Impact on Policy and Practice	488
20. A Critical Analysis of Child Protection Within the Primary and Post Primary School Sector	522
IMPLEMENTING OUTCOMES SOUGHT BY SURVIVORS	
21. The Role of Restorative Justice in Responding to Historical Child Sexual Abuse	570
22. Practical Issues to Consider	593
23. Indicators of the Likely Scale of Historical Sexual Abuse in Schools	604
24. Co-operation of Religious Orders with a Future Inquiry	617
RECOMMENDATIONS BASED ON SURVIVORS' VIEWS	
25. Conclusion: A Potential Framework for Government Response	633
26. Proposed Terms of Reference and Framework for a Commission of Investigation into Historical Sexual Abuse in Schools Run by Religious Orders	664

VOLUME 5

APPENDICES

669

1. Survivor Engagement Guide to Potential Government Responses
2. About the Survivor Engagement Process
3. Survivor Engagement Participant Information Booklet
4. Report on Child Protection for the Scoping Inquiry by Dr. Helen Buckley
5. Report on Restorative Justice for the Scoping Inquiry by CES
6. Meaning of Terms Used by the Scoping Inquiry
7. Religious Order Records Schools Table
8. ERST and Christian Brothers Data
9. Terms of Reference
10. List of Schools Where Survivors Reported Sexual Abuse in the Survivor Engagement Questionnaire
11. List of 59 unrecognised schools provided by Tusla
12. Extracts from NBSCCCI Review Reports: Quality of Records Held
13. Hospitaller Order of St John of God Schools

Email: survivorengagement@esi.gov.ie

Telephone: +353 (0)906 483610

Post: Scoping Inquiry, c/o Department of Education,
Marlborough Street, Dublin 1